# AGENDA

- The College Scorecard

- Which students are captured?

- How are earnings data captured?

- Data considerations

- Gainful Employment

- Program earnings (major-by-major earnings)

- Essential questions

- Timeline

- Steps to take

# College Scorecard

- Launched by Obama Administration in September 2015

- Two elements of Scorecard:
  - Consumer-facing (website/mobile app)
  - Researcher-facing (database)
    - More than 150 million data points, back to 1996-97 academic year

- Updated annually – all published data remains associated with institution for an entire calendar year

- Data pulled from variety of federal sources, but primarily IPEDS

# Consumer-facing iteration

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

SHARE THIS SCHOOL

# University of the District of Columbia ★

Washington, DC
3,695 undergraduate students
udc.edu

**4** Year  **Public**  **City**  **Medium**

Historically Black College and University

Map tiles by Stamen Design, under CC BY 3.0.
Data by OpenStreetMap, under ODbL.

| Average Annual Cost ⓘ | Graduation Rate ⓘ | Salary After Attending ⓘ |
|---|---|---|
| $15,532 | 14% | $35,200 |

Costs ⊕

Financial Aid & Debt ⊕

Graduation & Retention ⊕

Earnings After School ⊕

Student Body ⊕

SAT/ACT Scores ⊕

Academic Programs ⊕

**NAICU**

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*



SHARE THIS SCHOOL

# University of the District of Columbia ☆

Washington, DC
3,695 undergraduate students
udc.edu

**4** Year   **🏛** Public   **🏙** City   **🏘** Medium

Historically Black College and University

Map tiles by Stamen Design, under CC BY 3.0. Data by OpenStreetMap, under ODbL.

| Average Annual Cost ⓘ | Graduation Rate ⓘ | Salary After Attending ⓘ |
|---|---|---|
| $15,532 | 14% | $35,200 |

Costs ⊕

Financial Aid & Debt ⊕

Graduation & Retention ⊕

Earnings After School ⊕

Student Body ⊕

SAT/ACT Scores ⊕

Academic Programs ⊕

NAICU

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

**NAICU**

## Earnings After School

**Salary After
Attending**

$35,200

## Student Body

## SAT/ACT Scores

## Academic Programs

NOW SPEAKING:

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# Which students are captured?

- **Salary After Attending:** the median earnings of former students who received federal financial aid, at 10 years after entering the school. The information is based on all locations of the school.

- **Key facts:**
  - Earnings data only include federal student aid recipients (Title IV)

  - 10 years from when student *enters* the institution
    - All entering students counted, not limited to completers
    - Only includes first-time, full-time students; no transfers-in
    - Undergraduates-only, graduate students are not measured

  - Data restricted to students not currently enrolled, so students currently enrolled in graduate school are excluded from calculations

  - All campuses included – not just home campus

  - Institution-wide; all qualifying undergrads included in calculation

NAICU

# Which students are captured?

- Scorecard currently displays median earnings gathered in 2014-15, capturing 2004-05 entrance cohort

- Data are suppressed for IHEs with fewer than 30 students to ensure privacy and statistical representation

- Data published in database, but not consumer-facing tool:
  - Earnings data for 6, 7, 8, and 9 years from enrollment
  - 10th, 25th, 75th, and 90th percentile earnings
  - Gender breakdown for all years of earnings
  - Dependency-status breakdown for all years of earnings

- Recently removed statistic estimating percentage of former students earnings more than $25k annually

NOW SPEAKING:

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# How are earnings data captured?

- Department of Education maintains student borrowing records via the National Student Loan Data System for Students (NSLDS)

- NSLDS sends query to Department of Treasury, which maintains tax records, for annual earnings

- Treasury reviews any W2 or Schedule SE associated with the former student for that calendar year, calculates total amount of wages and deferred compensation for cohort, and sends back to ED

- ED publishes data on College Scorecard for public consumption, and releases deeper dive into earnings in researcher-facing Scorecard database

NAICU

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# Data considerations

- Earnings are estimated for undergraduate Title IV recipients only
  - About 72% of independent college students receive either a Pell Grant, federal loan, or both
  - Wide fluctuations among institutions on fraction of aided students

- Earnings are presented only for non-enrolled workers; graduate students are not included in calculation

- Earnings are measured for all Title IV students who attended an institution, regardless of completion status

- Significant variability across institutions by Title IV student populations, resulting in potentially biased estimates

NAICU

Tim Powers

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# Gainful Employment

- The GE regulations have been ongoing saga since 2010

- Trump Administration recently held negotiated rulemaking sessions on GE, deciding to effectively eliminate GE as a federal accountability mechanism

- It is in proposed final GE regulation that ED proposed releasing earnings data on all majors at all colleges:
  - "The Department plans to update the College Scorecard, or a similar web-based tool, to provide program-level outcomes for all higher education programs, at all institutions that participate in the programs authorized by title IV of the Higher Education Act of 1965, as amended, (title IV, HEA programs), which would improve transparency and inform student enrollment decisions through a market-based accountability system."

NAICU

# Major-by-major (programmatic) earnings

- ED began collecting program-level (i.e. major) data in 2012
  - Not currently published anywhere

- "Program" is determined by Classification of Instructional Programs (CIP codes)
  - 2-digit, 4-digit, 6-digit depending on specificity desired
    - 09: Communication, Journalism, and Related Programs
    - 09.04: Journalism
    - 09.0402: Broadcast Journalism

- "Research suggests that the variation across programs within an institution may be even greater than aggregate earnings across institutions"

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# Major-by-major (programmatic) earnings

- Likely that ED will use first available program-level data, which will reflect earnings just six years from enrollment (two years after on-time completion)
  - "Although ultimately we want to focus on longer-term earnings after graduation, we do not want to wait until those data are available to revise the Scorecard. So in the initial years of the expanded Scorecard, we will focus on two- or three-year earnings data." – Liz Hill, Department of Education

- Major concerns about context of data, given longer term realization of bachelor's degree vs. associate's or short-term certificate programs

NAICU

**Tim Powers**

*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# A few essential questions

- Will published earnings timeline be the same for all levels of programs? Will certificate program earnings be published on the same timeline as bachelor's, master's, or doctoral programs?

- Will students be counted for both undergraduate major and graduate program, if they continue their education?
  - Double-counting

- Will current 30 student n-size policy be continued, or will changes be made?

- Will any qualitative data be published on Scorecard to provide context about value of degree beyond earnings?

**NAICU**

# A few more essential questions…

- Will graduate programs (including doctoral programs) be measured and published?

- Will transfer students be captured? If so, for which institution will their earnings be counted?

- How will ED treat students who double major?

- Will data be published for majors that an institution has ended or modified significantly?

- Will institutions have the ability to correct or verify data published on the Scorecard?

**Tim Powers**
*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# A preview?

- The State of Texas released an interactive programmatic earnings tool in March 2018 ([seekUT](#))

- Links US Census data from the Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics survey for all institutions, degrees, and majors within the University of Texas system
  - A similar system is under construction in Colorado

- Displays 1st, 5th, and 10th year earnings for all completers
  - College Scorecard likely to include all enrollees, not completers

- Does not include independent colleges nor community colleges, only public baccalaureate degrees and above

NAICU

NOW SPEAKING:

**Tim Powers**
*Director of
Student Aid Policy*

# Steps to take

- Review the enrollment patterns of your specific majors and degree programs – do certain majors enroll higher proportions of Title IV recipients than others? How will enrollment patterns impact each major's earnings data?

- Analyze 2012-13 entering cohort, likely to be first cohort counted in programmatic earnings

- Consider Title IV participation rates of undergraduate students vs. graduate students and those rates may impact each program's earnings

# Timeline

- ED can unilaterally update the Scorecard at any time – no negotiated rulemaking or congressional approval is necessary
  - Though the major-by-major earnings addition to the Scorecard was announced in conjunction with the proposed final rule on Gainful Employment, ED is not tethered to the GE rulemaking timeline to update the College Scorecard

- No firm commitment from ED on whether it will release a technical paper to explain rationale or whether it will give forewarning to institutions when major-by-major earnings are added to Scorecard
  - Scorecard typically receives annual update in October

- Best guess is Fall 2019 for first iteration of major-by-major/programmatic earnings

# Questions

Thank you!

Tim Powers

tim@naicu.edu

(202) 785-8866